

Garrity, Marty

From: Luke Mattingly <LMattingly@carelink.org>
Sent: Thursday, April 30, 2020 1:34 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Public Comment PHW&L May 4, 2020 Agenda Items J & K
Attachments: Public Comment Public Health 20200504 J_K.pdf

Luke Mattingly
CEO/President

(501) 688-7483

(501) 688-7437 Fax

P.O. Box 5988

North Little Rock, AR 72119-5988

lmattingly@carelink.org

www.carelink.org



PROTECTED HEALTH INFORMATION NOTICE PRIVACY WARNING

"Confidentiality Notice: The information contained in this e-mail message and any attachment(s) is the property of CareLink and may be protected by state and federal laws governing disclosure of private information. It is intended solely for the use of the entity to whom this e-mail is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that reading, copying, or distributing this transmission is **STRICTLY PROHIBITED**. The sender has not waived any applicable privileges by sending the accompanying transmission. If you have received this transmission in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete the message and attachment(s) from your system."

Public Comment

Arkansas Legislative Committee on Public Health, Welfare and Labor
Monday, May 4, 2020

Comments pertain to both Agenda Items J & K:
Arkansas Department of Health, Division of Health Facility Services, Review of Rule which changes the requirements of the Home Health and Private Care Agencies to comply with Act 811 of 2019

Comments submitted by the Act 811 Advisory Rule Working Group
Luke Mattingly, Working Group Chair

The Working Group supports the rules as presented and believe the revisions meet the intent of the Act 811.

The Working Group met diligently from July through September of 2019 and worked closely with Health Facilities Services to provide recommendations and review each section of the rules. Input was provided by all members of the Group and consensus was reached on all changes cumulating in a unanimous decision to support the presented rules.

The Group would like to take this opportunity to thank the Legislature, the Administration and the Department of Health for addressing the need to update the proposed rules. Further, we thank Representative Clint Penzo for his keen interest in the topic and his support throughout the process and Senator Sample for sponsoring the initial legislation. Also, we are appreciative of Health Facility Services for their attentiveness, guidance and responsiveness in working with the group.

Garrity, Marty

From: Paul Means <paul.means51@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, April 30, 2020 3:51 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Comment for May 4 Committee on Public Health meeting
Attachments: P Means Comment ADEQ Rule 5.pdf

(a copy of this comment is attached to this email as a PDF file)

April 30, 2020

Senator Missy Irvin, Chair Representative Jack Ladyman, Chair
Committee on Public Health, Welfare and Labor

RE: Committee Meeting Monday, May 4; Agenda Item E
ADEQ Prohibition of Issuance of new permits pursuant to Rule 5

Dear Chairmen and Committee Members:

I am a member of the Ozark Society, an organization established in 1962 for the purpose of protecting the Buffalo River. We are still actively pursuing this purpose today.

Agenda Item D on the May 4 agenda is a report by the Big Creek Research Project of the facts on which the Rule 5 moratorium is based.

I will not repeat any of that discussion.

At the March 9th committee meeting, Representative Jeff Wardlaw asked a simple question of the ADEQ staff presenting the Rule 5 Moratorium.

To paraphrase his question, he asked that if hog farm permit applications within the Buffalo River watershed can be addressed on an individual permit basis, then why do we need a moratorium in the rule?

ADEQ representatives did not give an adequate answer.

I would like to provide the Committee with an answer to Representative Wardlaw's question. Including the moratorium in Rule 5 gives notice to potential hog farmers, conservation districts, engineering firms, and pork processors that permits for hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed will not be approved. This saves all of the above parties the time and expense of preparing a permit application and submitting it to ADEQ, only have the application turned down.

I regret that I cannot be present in person to answer questions from committee members and look forward to the time we can all again safely gather together for legislative meetings.

Sincerely,

Paul N. Means

Paul Means
3 Keswick Cove
Little Rock, AR 72212
paul.means51@gmail.com

April 30, 2020

Senator Missy Irvin, Chair
Representative Jack Ladyman, Chair
Committee on Public Health Welfare and Labor

RE: Committee Meeting Monday, May 4; Agenda Item E
ADEQ Prohibition of Issuance of new permits pursuant to Rule 5

Dear Chairmen and Committee Members:

I am a member of the Ozark Society, an organization established in 1962 for the purpose of protecting the Buffalo River. We are still actively pursuing this purpose today.

Agenda Item D on the May 4 agenda is a report by the Big Creek Research Project of the facts on which the Rule 5 moratorium is based. I will not repeat any of that discussion.

At the March 9th committee meeting, Representative Jeff Wardlaw asked a simple question of the ADEQ staff presenting the Rule 5 Moratorium. To paraphrase his question, he asked that if hog farm permit applications within the Buffalo River watershed can be addressed on an individual permit basis, then why do we need a moratorium in the rule? ADEQ representatives did not give an adequate answer.

I would like to provide the Committee with an answer to Representative Wardlaw's question. Including the moratorium in Rule 5 gives notice to potential hog farmers, conservation districts, engineering firms, and pork processors that permits for hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed will not be approved. This saves all of the above parties the time and expense of preparing a permit application and submitting it to ADEQ, only have the application turned down.

I regret that I cannot be present in person to answer questions from committee members and look forward to the time we can all again safely gather together for legislative meetings.

Sincerely,

Paul N. Means

Garrity, Marty

From: Ginny Masullo <masullo.ginny1@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 11:18 AM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Rule 5 and Rule 6

Dear Public Health,

It is in the best interests of the State of Arkansas to enact this moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feed operations in the watershed of the Buffalo River.

The threat that such operations pose to the tourism industry should be enough reason to do so. From BCRET REPORT:

1. "The Big Creek Watershed below the C&H Farm and application field locations, lie within a karst hydrologic system of great complexity exhibiting intimate connection of surface-water and groundwater regimes. These characteristics endow the hydrologic system as an important recreational resource locally and regionally, but also render the system vulnerable to contamination." -.(*BCRET Final Report, October 24, 2019, Chapter 2, p.2*)
2. "Future additions of any nutrients (i.e., as mineral fertilizer, swine slurry, or poultry litter) to fields, which received slurry from C&H Farms, should be carefully managed, so as not to lead further increases in soil test P . (*BCRET Final Report, October 24, 2019 Executive Summary pp. 6 and 7. And, C&H 2018 Hog Farm Annual Report.*)
3. Why would the State of Arkansas risk adding more medium and large sources of swine slurry to the economic engine of the Buffalo River by not supporting Rule 5 and Rule 6 ?

Please support Rules 5 and Rules 6 for a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine CAFOS.

Ginny Masullo
1837 Ruppel Road
Fayetteville AR 72704

Garrity, Marty

From: Jason Lamar <lamarilium@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 11:11 AM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Support permanent moratorium against Cafos

Hello

I want to make permanent the moratorium against CAFOs, large scale animal feeding operations in the buffalo river watershed.

My family has enjoyed the Buffalo for generations and we travel from across the country to enjoy it. This should be preserved for future generations.

Jason Lamar
Indianapolis Indiana
46219

Garrity, Marty

From: Marlene Lamar <mlamar921@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 11:11 AM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Support for moratorium

I support a permanent moratorium on hog farming in the Buffalo River.

Garrity, Marty

From: Dana Lamar <danalamar05@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 11:44 AM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: No Hog Farms

Near Buffalo National River, PLEASE!!!!!!!

Sent from my iPhone

Garrity, Marty

From: allison.fields04@gmail.com
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 11:55 AM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Please implement permanent moratorium of hog farming @ Buffalo National River

Hi,
I'm writing to communicate my support for a permanent moratorium on hog farming (and related pollution) in the buffalo national river.

My family and I travel to Gilbert AR every summer for a family reunion and float trips on the Buffalo. It's beautiful and should be preserved!

Please don't prioritize farming over this AR natural wonder and tourism.

thank you for your kind attention.

Best regards,

Allison Fields
US Citizen

Garrity, Marty

From: Pete Petersen <petepetersen47@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:32 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: buffalo river

Please support a permanent moratorium medium and large hog CAFOs so we dont have to go this process of protecting the river anymore.

Thanks, Pete

Garrity, Marty

From: victoria mcclendon <viktorialeigh@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:39 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Buffalo River

I strongly support the permanent moratorium on medium and large hog CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

I believe this is one of the smartest ways to protect the investment in the value and enjoyment and revenue generating qualities of this national river in Arkansas.

I spend money whenever I visit the Buffalo River, and share its fine experience with visitors.

Gov. Hutchison has proceeded in due consideration of all parties directly affected and directly involved to find a fair and affordable solution.

Establishing this moratorium will be forward action -giving notice, avoiding reacting to a situation growing dangerous in the future that repeats itself-and is a strong path.

Arkansas is a unique state with distinct strengths. I firmly believe this moratorium is, in the best way, a representation of who we are and have been.

Sincerely,
Victoria Bransford McClendon
Fayetteville AR.

Garrity, Marty

From: Brian Thompson COM <thompsonadd@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:49 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Comments on permanent moratorium - medium & large hog CAFOs in Buffalo River watershed

Dear Committee Members:

This permanent moratorium is overwhelmingly supported by Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. This desire for preservation and protection of the Buffalo National River by the state's voters is formidable. Note that during the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 negatives were registered and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Public's interests should come first on this.

I would respectfully suggest that folks would be proud to see Arkansas take a leadership roll in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures. Governor Hutchinson instinctively understands this and supports this moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team that performed monitoring of the single facility permitted, recognized significantly increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek and excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented. Anecdotally, the Buffalo has suffered its very worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Some of this algae is dangerous to human health.

Finally, the state has invested significant financial resources to bring about the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed, *this moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary again.*

Respectfully,

Brian A. Thompson
3428 E. Wyman Rd.
Fayetteville, AR. 72701
479 879-0688

Garrity, Marty

From: Zane Sturm <zane.sturm1@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:53 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium on CAFO in Buffalo River watershed

To whom it may concern:

Hog operations come and go.

There is only one Buffalo National River.

Too many people worked to get the designation for this beautiful area, too many local residents gave up the rights to pass property they owned to their children, and too much stinks about the very idea of allowing this type of operation, to delay the moratorium any longer. Please get the job done. Have you ever smelled a hog operation of any type?

Do you realize how this delay stinks to the citizens?

Zane Sturm

Garrity, Marty

From: James Seawel <jjseawel@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:54 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: No to Buffalo River hog farms

To Whom It May Concern,

I am writing to you now from my cabin in Fallsville, Newton County, AR. My family has been in the Arkansas Ozarks since long before the Civil War. We are a hunting and fishing and, yes, farming family, but we recognize the environmental impact of large or even medium size hog farming to our rivers. Our beloved Buffalo is the jewel of Arkansas and should be treated as such. I am pro-farming, pro-agriculture, and even pro pig, but not on our National River!

Thank you and God bless,

James Seawel

[Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPhone](#)

Garrity, Marty

From: Deb Bartholomew <texasred@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:54 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent moratorium on CAFOs in Buffalo River watershed

I believe the Buffalo River is our most precious natural resource. I am so proud of the steps Governor Hutchinson and the state authorities have taken already to protect it by investing significant financial resources to bring about the equitable closure of a CAFO in the watershed.

The permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed ensures this investment does not become necessary again, and also that further damage does not occur from additional phosphorus loading.

Please keep the Buffalo beautiful for all of us, locals and tourists alike.

Deb Bartholomew
300 Jonathan Dr
Bentonville AR 72712

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

Garrity, Marty

From: Bonita Ouellette <ouellettebo57@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 12:57 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Buffalo National River

1. The Buffalo National River is the crown jewel of Arkansas and is a valuable tourism destination in the state contributing \$54.9 million to the area in 2018.
2. 86% of the watershed which feeds the Buffalo River lies outside of the National Park boundary and deserves robust protection by the state. A medium to large CAFO produces approximately 2.5 million gallons of untreated raw swine sewage yearly. This liquid animal waste must be disposed of near the CAFO because transportation costs to distribute it out of the Buffalo National River watershed are cost prohibitive.
3. The pasture soils in the watershed are too thin to accommodate this industrial level distribution of CAFO waste that contains far more nutrients than the vegetation could possibly use resulting in soil with legacy phosphorous that can continue to leach for years producing algal blooms.
4. The Buffalo watershed is particularly vulnerable to pollutants due to karst geology that underlies it. Dye trace studies sited by the Big Creek Research Extension Team's report show just how far and how fast water can run underground.
5. In 2018 Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality placed Big Creek and 14 miles of the Buffalo River on the 303(d) draft list of impaired streams.
6. The Buffalo National River is an economic engine for the area. Many family businesses such as outfitters, restaurants, farm to table growers, cabin rentals and more rely upon the health of the river to support and sustain their livelihoods for their families and employees. Approval of these rule changes makes the temporary moratorium PERMANENT.
7. The state has already invested a considerable amount of money and time trying to correct the mistake of allowing a large CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. We need a permanent moratorium to preserve and protect the Buffalo National River and to ensure that such a mistake never happens again.

Garrity, Marty

From: Teresa Smith <terhsm@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:04 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFOs in the Buffalo Watershed

To the legislative committees on Public Health, Welfare, and Labor:

I appreciate the opportunity to comment via email during your meeting today, May 1, 2020.

The delays in implementing a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs affecting the Buffalo National River has been puzzling (if not suspicious), but I am hopeful that the public support for this measure, as well as that of Governor Hutchinson, will finally be given the weight they deserve. Although, happily, the delays have allowed for a significant increase in the number of citizens willing to voice their opposition to the continuing pollution of American's first national river. If we could only count those who are shy or reticent about voicing their opinion, numbers would again increase to show the popularity of this moratorium.

Facts have been presented over the years and cannot be disputed – these nasty feeding operations are not only massive polluters of water, soil, and air, they threaten the health and well-being of Arkansans state-wide. But not just ourselves, poison and pollution affect the millions of tourists who visit our magnificent state each year. There is no logic, only an odor of malfeasance, in further delays.

I strongly urge each of you to do the right thing, the moral thing, the honorable thing by once and forever voting to uphold the will of the people. Support a beautiful and natural Arkansas. Abide by votes, support, and the allocation of funds already in place. Show the rest of our nation what integrity and reasonableness look like.

Thank you for your time and consideration,

Teresa Smith

Springdale, AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Marti Olesen <molesen12@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:26 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Comments for committee members on Reg 5 & 6 Permanent Moratorium

Dear Committee Members:

This Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium is supported by a great majority of Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. Conservation and protection of the Buffalo National River is overwhelmingly supported by the state's voters. During the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 commenters were registered as unfavorable, and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Arkansas Public's interests should come first on deciding this important issue. People in Arkansas approve that Governor Hutchinson stake a leadership role in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures, and he supports this permanent moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team (BCRET) detailed significant increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek as well as excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented in their own final report and in the analyses performed by experts. Many visitors and residents along the Buffalo noted the worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Strains of this algae are dangerous to human health and animals.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. *Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.*

Respectfully,

Marti and Larry Olesen
P.O. Box 104
Ponca, AR 72670

Garrity, Marty

From: FRED PAILLET <fredp@cox.net>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:35 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFO moratorium for Buffalo River watershed

I strongly support extending the moratorium on CAFO's in the sensitive Buffalo River watershed where the extensive presence of karst formations should rule out the siting of such waste intensive land uses in any event.

Frederick Paillet

Bentonville AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Randall Avery <r.avery@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:38 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Hog Farms Near the Buffalo River

Please enact a permanent moratorium on hog farms near the Buffalo River and its tributaries. The Buffalo is a unique resource for our State. Its beauty and cleanliness needs to be preserved, not only as a resource for today, but for the generations who will follow. Please act now to protect this scenic marvel.

Gratefully,
Randy Avery
Rogers, AR

Sent from my iPhone

Garrity, Marty

From: Mark Lamar <marklamar28@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:44 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Say NO TO HOG FARMS!

I would like to voice my objection to hog farming in the Buffalo River area. We must do everything we can to protect this National River and Arkansas treasure. I have had the privilege of enjoying this River with my family since the early 70's and want to continue to do.

SAY NO TO HOG FARMS!!!

Mark Lamar
3201 Day Dr
Jonesboro AR. 72404

Garrity, Marty

From: Carole Degginger <caroledegginger@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:45 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium on CAFOs

I firmly support a permanent moratorium of CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. As a property owner in Newton County and as someone who enjoys all the beauty The Natural State has to offer it concerns me. We must do whatever we can to protect these national treasures.

CAFOs also create an economic force that is hard for the family farmer to compete with in the marketplace.

Thank you,
Carole Degginger

Garrity, Marty

From: Janet H. Parsch <jparsch@uark.edu>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:45 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Committees on Public Health, Welfare, and Labor, May 4, 2020: permanent moratorium on CAFO permits in the Buffalo National River watershed

Ark. State Representatives and Senators:

Please support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed. We have seen during the COVID-19 pandemic how vital our Arkansas natural resources are to our economic and personal well-being. It is critical that these natural resources be kept healthy for our use and for visitors to our state. That includes maintaining water quality in the Buffalo National River. Thank you. Janet Parsch

Janet Parsch
467 N. Rockcliff Rd.
Fayetteville AR 72701
479.442.3817 home (preferred)
479.236.7429 cell

Garrity, Marty

From: markdegginger <markdegginger@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:49 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Support of permanent moratorium

Please include my support of permanent moratorium on large and medium c.a.f.o.s within the Buffalo National River basin. The thought of attempting more c.a.f.o.s while expecting different results is the classic definition of insanity. Thank you, Mark Degginger

Sent from my Samsung Galaxy , an AT&T LTE smartphone

Garrity, Marty

From: Lowell Collins <lowell01@aol.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:58 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Support Permanent Moratorium

The Buffalo National River is America's first national river. It is the responsibility of all of us to continue to protect this important natural area from any kind of damage or pollution.

CAFO's are not environmentally sound practice in karst topography. CAFO refuse has the potential to pollute natural waterways. A permanent moratorium on the BNR watershed is necessary to protect the BNR!!

Please support the permanent moratorium.

Lowell Collins
9995 E Hwy 72
Bentonville, 72712

Garrity, Marty

From: Marian Johnson <marnnej@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:02 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent moratorium against CAFO

I have been closely following the information for and against a permanent moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed preventing medium to large concentrated animal feeding operations from beginning business in that area of AR.

Regulations 5 and 6 were not fulfilled by the previous C and H Hog Farm and were subsequently bought out by the State of AR at the recommendation of Governor Hutchinson. The Governor also strongly desires this permanent moratorium to be in place stopping further problems from arising that might also eventually cost our state large sums of money.

We need to place this moratorium into affect to protect our beautiful Buffalo River and the watershed.

Studies did show that soil and water were affected.

A huge portion of tourism dollars are at stake if the Buffalo River is subsequently fouled by further building/industry/large scale farming.

I stand with Governor Hutchinson and desire this moratorium be decided up and put into law.

Sincerely,
Marian L. Johnson
2521 Mills Park Road
Bryant, AR. 72022

501-517-4862

marnnej@gmail.com

Garrity, Marty

From: Eunice Millett <eunicemillett@hotmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:04 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium on CAFO in Buffalo River Watershed

Dear Arkansas Legislators

I am writing to support the permanent ban on Large and medium CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. No longer should our state have to worry about harming our wonderful National River. Please pass this ban immediately!

Eunice Millett
Fayetteville Ar

Sent from my iPad

Garrity, Marty

From: Teresa Hayes <terandtom@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:09 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: In favor of permanent moratorium

Dear committee members:

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. The research showed the impact on the Buffalo River from both phosphates in the soil and nitrates in the water leading to algae overgrowth. I believe a national treasure like the Buffalo River is an asset to the state and should be protected from degradation. Without a permanent moratorium, this is not possible.

Respectfully,

Teresa Hayes
HC 70 Box 561
Jasper, AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Kathleen Trotter <kalkathy@aol.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:20 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFO moratorium on the Buffalo River

I want to express SUPPORT -- and urge PROMPT IMPLEMENTATION -- of a permanent moratorium on medium and large sized CAFOs within the Buffalo River watershed. Since the public overwhelmingly supports this action, please move forward with approval and implementation plans immediately.

The Buffalo River is a favorite destination for hundreds of thousands of Arkansans, as evidenced by recent visits before it was closed. Further, it is the pride of Arkansas, envied by those outside the state, as evidenced by the guests from all over who were recently there in droves. It will be a shameful thing for Arkansas if we allow this pristine treasure to be ruined for the profit of agribusiness.

Thank you.
Kathleen "Kathy" Trotter
10767 Sycamore Rd
Lowell AR
479-957-7071

Garrity, Marty

From: Judi Nail <jnail1113@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:20 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium on CAFOs on the Buffalo National River

Dear Committee Members:

I understand there is a committee meeting on Monday concerning a moratorium on CAFOs on the Buffalo River and due to Covid-19 concerns the public cannot attend. Please take note that there has been a substantial public outcry against Concentrated Animal Factory Operations in the watersheds that feed the Buffalo. The state of Arkansas has invested a lot of money in getting rid of the C and H Hog Operation and does not need a repeat. I have been an observer of the Buffalo River for the past 50 years and know from observation what the C and H Hog Operation did to the river and as a tax paying citizen I want to see the river heal from the time the CAFO was operating. Please protect Arkansas' natural wonder and not allow our river to be degraded, there other places to have hog waste or any animal waste than in an area of karst topography.

Thank you,
Judi Nail
620 Fern
Mountain Home, AR 72653

Garrity, Marty

From: Lawrence Ireland <ozarkireland@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:25 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFOs in the Buffalo watershed

I don't understand why I even have to send this email. It should be obvious:

1. The Buffalo River is a national treasure - unique, accessible, and beautiful.
2. Concentrated animal operations cannot contain their pollution, given the area's topography, hydrology, and geology.
3. This is not an argument that needs to be debated ever again. Prohibit CAFOs from the Buffalo River watershed forever.

To whom it may concern:

I live on the beautiful, pristine Bull Creek in Missouri. I value tremendously, and help protect, the quality of its waters. But the Buffalo is 100x better, with its bluffs, hollers, and floatable waterway. Please, PLEASE protect it. Forever.

Sincerely,
Lawrence Ireland
1169 Creekside Rd
Chestnutridge MO 65630
417-234-5076

Garrity, Marty

From: Mary Ann Hicks <rionme@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:27 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFO

Dear Committee Members:

This Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium is supported by a great majority of Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. Conservation and protection of the Buffalo National River is overwhelmingly supported by the state's voters. During the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 comments were registered as unfavorable, and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Arkansas Public's interests should come first on deciding this important issue.

People in Arkansas approve that Governor Hutchinson take a leadership role in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures, and he supports this permanent moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team (BCRET) detailed significant increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek as well as excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented in their own final report and in the analyses performed by experts. Many visitors and residents along the Buffalo noted the worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Strains of this algae are dangerous to human health and animals.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.

Respectfully,
Mary Ann Hicks

Life's about changin',nothin' ever stays the same.

"When we try to pick out anything by itself, we find it hitched to everything else in the Universe." - John Muir

Garrity, Marty

From: David Martinson <dom@uark.edu>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:28 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: CAFO Moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed

My intent with this message is to go on the record in support of a permanent moratorium on operation of medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Such action appears to be the only way to protect our irreplaceable national treasure.

The state has invested heavily with our scarce public funds to correct the grievous error made during the Bebe administration. The citizens of Arkansas deserve for this investment to be protected for enjoyment by future generations.

David Martinson
2184 E Lensfield Pl
Fayetteville, AR 72701

Garrity, Marty

From: Carol Phillips <historicalgeek@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:31 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Buffalo River

Dear folks,

It is impossible to imagine why any Arkansas official would delay saving our most precious and important natural resource, the Buffalo River.

Feel free to email me back and let me know why you are delaying this action to save the Buffalo River for citizens of Arkansas.

Stay well.

Carol Phillips
Bella Vista, AR

[Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android](#)

Garrity, Marty

From: Daryl Boles <dboles1969@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:35 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium

I support Governor Asa Hutchinson in the moratorium of hog CAFO'S in the Buffalo River watershed. This is a no brainer, and don't trust Farm Bureau, since they have sold out to big agribusiness!
Daryl Boles

Garrity, Marty

From: Corey Duncan <coreybduncan@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:51 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent Moratorium

Please create a permanent moratorium on all future CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed, and not just hogs, all CAFO's.

It is well known that CAFO's waste concentration creates problems around the world and particularly in areas with highly porous topography like the Buffalo River watershed. Please do not let the previous mistake of letting a CAFO into the area happen again. There is very little gain for so much loss and potential for loss. The last CAFO wasn't even for an American owned company. Please make a permanent moratorium on all CAFO's in the Buffalo National River watershed to keep America's first National River beautiful.

Thanks
Corey Duncan

Garrity, Marty

From: carol florida <carolflorida9@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:57 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: APC&EC Regulation 5&6 revisions/rule makings

ARKANSAS LEGISLATURE'S PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE:

As an Arkansas resident, I encourage you to approve the APC&EC Regulation 5&6 revisions/rule makings that include a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs (**Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations**) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Approval of these rule changes makes the temporary moratorium PERMANENT. The state has already invested a considerable amount of money and time trying to correct the mistake of allowing a large CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. We need a permanent moratorium to preserve and protect the Buffalo National River and to ensure that such a mistake never happens again. Let your support be part of your legacy. **It is the right thing to do. Especially now.**

Thank you,

Carol Florida

Garrity, Marty

From: Mark Miller <onsrranger@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:02 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent moratorium on medium and large scale CAFO'd in Buffalo Watershed

I strongly agree and support a permanent moratorium on medium and large scale CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. Due to its biological and scenic significance and karst topography of the Buffalo I strongly believe it would be especially vulnerable to any potential source and non-source water pollution associated with CAFO's.

Mark A Miller
60 Fairway Bella Vista
AR 72714
417-253-3533

Garrity, Marty

From: Phyllis Head <brooklyngirl951@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:07 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Please keep moratorium

Dear Committee Members:

This Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium is supported by a great majority of Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. Conservation and protection of the Buffalo National River is overwhelmingly supported by the state's voters. During the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 commenters were registered as unfavorable, and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Arkansas Public's interests should come first on deciding this important issue.

People in Arkansas approve that Governor Hutchinson takes a leadership role in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures, and he supports this permanent moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team (BCRET) detailed significant increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek as well as excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented in their own final report and in the analyses performed by experts. Many visitors and residents along the Buffalo noted the worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Strains of this algae are dangerous to human health and animals.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.

Respectfully,
Phyllis Head

Garrity, Marty

From: Ken Ackley <krackley1@cox.net>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:10 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Hog farms in Buffalo water shed

Please do what you can to keep hog farms out of the Buffalo River watershed.

Ken Ackley

Garrity, Marty

From: Lynn Risser <lynnkrisser@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:11 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Support for Permanent Moratorium on the Buffalo

Dear Legislators:

I regret the public is unable to attend meetings on Monday because of health concerns, but I am sure you will continue to strongly acknowledge public support for the permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo watershed.

As you know, the moratorium insures the protection of the Buffalo National River which is in the care of all the citizens of Arkansas. I know you will respect this responsibility and make the moratorium permanent.

We are meeting with you in spirit.

Sincerely,
Lynn Risser
432 N. Assembly Drive
Fayetteville, AR 72701

Garrity, Marty

From: Peggy S Bulla <sunnypegs@aol.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:20 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium for CAFOs in Buffalo Watershed

Public Health, Welfare and Commerce Committee:

Please do not delay the implementation of the moratorium in the Buffalo Watershed. This water resource in Arkansas is invaluable for its citizens now and for the coming generations.

Please act quickly and favorably for people and the environment. Thank you.

Peggy S Bulla
11597 High Sky Inn Rd
Hindsville AR 72738

Sent from my iPhone

Garrity, Marty

From: Grant Scarsdale <grantscarsdale@me.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:20 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium

Dear Committee Members:

This Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium is supported by a great majority of Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. Conservation and protection of the Buffalo National River is overwhelmingly supported by the state's voters. During the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 commenters were registered as unfavorable, and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Arkansas Public's interests should come first on deciding this important issue.

People in Arkansas approve that Governor Hutchinson stake a leadership role in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures, and he supports this permanent moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team (BCRET) detailed significant increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek as well as excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented in their own final report and in the analyses performed by experts. Many visitors and residents along the Buffalo noted the worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Strains of this algae are dangerous to human health and animals.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.

Respectfully,

Grant Scarsdale

Garrity, Marty

From: Tom Burroughs <ozarktom@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:27 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Swine CAFOs Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium

Dear Committee Members:

This Reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium is supported by a great majority of Arkansans, both liberal and conservative. Conservation and protection of the Buffalo National River is overwhelmingly supported by the state's voters. During the original comment period, there were more than 400 public comments supporting this moratorium. Only 3 commenters were registered as unfavorable, and they were from organized lobbying groups. The Arkansas Public's interests should come first on deciding this important issue.

People in Arkansas approve that Governor Hutchinson stake a leadership role in protecting our National Park heritage and treasures, and he supports this permanent moratorium.

The Big Creek Research & Extension Team (BCRET) detailed significant increased levels of nitrates in Big Creek as well as excessive phosphorus loading in the soils. This is well documented in their own final report and in the analyses performed by experts. Many visitors and residents along the Buffalo noted the worst algae outbreaks over the course of the last three years of C&H operation. Strains of this algae are dangerous to human health and animals.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.

Respectfully,

Tom Burroughs
1296 Trestle St.
Winslow, AR 72959

Garrity, Marty

From: Kim Smith <kimvsmith@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:27 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent CAFO ban in the Buffalo River watershed

Please count me as a taxpayer and voter who is FOR the establishment of a permanent ban on concentrated animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed.

It's a good idea for our environment.

It's a good idea for our tourist-based economy in this area.

It's a good idea for our state's pocketbook, as it's extremely expensive to clean up an environmental disaster OR to close down a CAFO (as we've seen with the pig operation in St. Joe).

Thank you.

Kimberly Smith

Harrison, AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Kuhne, David <d.kuhne@tcu.edu>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:33 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: moratorium on pig farms in Buffalo Watershed

I am writing to express my support of a permanent moratorium on pig farming in the Buffalo River watershed. The dangers such farms present to the national treasure that is the Buffalo River are well documented.

In these times, we are unable to personally attend meetings to voice our support of the moratorium, but we forcefully present our support via this electronic channel.

Dave Kuhne
Fayetteville, Arkansas

Garrity, Marty

From: Terrie Martindale <terriemartindale@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:46 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: in favor of permanent moratorium Reg 5 & 6 for Buffalo National river

Dear Committee Members:

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine CAFOs on the Buffalo National River. I support our governor in his desire to protect our river and the fragile ecosystem within and around it by not allowing CAFOs in the watershed of the river.

Arkansas has spent significant financial resources to resolve the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. Approving a permanent moratorium ensures this investment does not become necessary to do all over again.

I ask you to support Reg 5 & 6.

Respectfully,

Terrie Martindale
8843 Hwy 43 S
Harrison, AR 72601

Garrity, Marty

From: Paul Moore <pmoores1@yahoo.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:56 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent Moratorium on CAFOs near the Buffalo River

Dear Commissioners and Committee members,

I believe a permanent moratorium on CAFOs is necessary to protect the Buffalo National River, its adoption would speak to the nation and the tourism industry **showing how Arkansas embraces and properly respects the national park designation.**

Our state has invested significant financial resources to bring about the equitable closure of a CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed, **this moratorium would preclude the investment does not become necessary again - prudent economic policy!**

The BCRET report analyzes only one swine CAFO contributing to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed. **A permanent moratorium will avoid further damage from additional phosphorus loading beyond what has already occurred and further protect the Buffalo's pristine waters.**

Sincerely,

Paul A. Moore
Prairie Grove, AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Bob Ross <bob.cathy.ross@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 3:57 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Moratorium on CAFOs

Good afternoon,

I request a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The State of Arkansas and others have spent a large amount of money to buy Out C and H Hog Farm. The Buffalo River has suffered damage from the effects of the farm and spreading waste on fields in the area. The taxpayers of Arkansas deserve the guarantee that this will never again be necessary.

Sincerely,
Cathy Ross
18125 Redbud Lane
Rogers, AR 72756

Sent from my iPhone

Garrity, Marty

From: Bill <troutman08@suddenlink.net>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 2:17 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: [SUSPECTED SPAM] Permanent moratorium on CAFO's

I am writing to share my strong support for the proposed permanent moratorium on all medium and large hog and other animal CAFO's in the Buffalo National River watershed. Thank you for your consideration, Bill Pettit, PO Box 15, Cotter, AR 72626.

Sent from my iPad

Garrity, Marty

From: Mark Lamar <marklamar28@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 1:33 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: [SUSPECTED SPAM] Hog farm on Buffalo

I would like to voice my objection of hog farms in the Buffalo River area. We must do everything we can to protect this National River and Arkansas treasure. I have been enjoying this river with my family since the early 70's.

Say NO TO HOG FARMS!!!

Mark Lamar
3201 Day Dr
Jonesboro, Arkansas 72404
Sent from my iPhone

Garrity, Marty

From: coolbeannp@earthlink.net
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 4:11 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Buffalo River

Please consider our beautiful state's natural resources, and the number of tourism dollars we have lost due to meat processing in vulnerable areas:

A permanent moratorium will avoid further damage from additional phosphorus loading beyond what has already occurred.

Truly,

Nancy Pierson
Gentry AR

Garrity, Marty

From: Jack and Pam Stewart <jampack1@mac.com>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 4:11 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: BNR Permanent Moratorium

Please support the reg 5 & 6 permanent moratorium to protect the Buffalo River against large scale industry. This moratorium is supported by Governor Hutchinson and all people who love, hike and float in the river valley. However, it is important to protect the watershed not only for the recreational pleasure it provides, but for the maintenance of the natural ecosystems along the river and valleys that surround it. They provide the clean air, clear water and a healthy soil, required to supply the native plants needed by pollinators and the insects which feed fish, frogs, and birds, etc. These services provide economic value that is likely way more than an industrial sized operation would. Pollution by from C&H CAFO has already been demonstrated to have visible harmful effects on the river .

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Pamela E. Stewart
PO Box 632 (NC 2555)
Jasper, , AR 72641

Garrity, Marty

From: Duane Woltjen <ozarktraveler1@att.net>
Sent: Friday, May 01, 2020 4:23 PM
To: BLR Rules
Subject: Permanent Hog CAFO prohibition

Please support the hog CAFO position of Governor Hutchinson for the Buffalo River watershed. The karst geology of the Buffalo River unalterably renders this as one of the most sensitive and easily polluted streams of the Ozarks as the C&H case so abundantly demonstrated to all but perhaps the most biased imaginable of observers including BCRET. Protect this gem of the Ozarks from future damage by the only means possible—do not expose it to further risk.

Duane W. Woltjen
821 Applebury Drive
Fayetteville, AR 72701

479-521-7032